



Ars Longa
Alvy Ray Smith, President

23 August 2004

Dr Ed Catmull, President
Pixar Animation Studios
1200 Park Avenue
Emeryville CA 94608

Dear Ed

I am hurt, and have been for some time, and have decided it is time to say so.

I just went to the Pixar website, as part of my preparation for a history of Lucasfilm/Pixar, which is in research by Michael Rubin, and looked at the History section under Company Info. The "history" begins in 1984 with *André & Wally B.* and John Lasseter. Then in 1986, Steve and you are mentioned, you as the co-founder of Pixar, implying I suppose that Steve is the other. There is no mention of my role as the other co-founder. Steve was, of course, our venture capitalist, in standard industry terminology and not a co-founder. Then in 1996 in the list of awardees for the Digital Compositing Academy Award, my name is omitted. Then in 1998 my name is again omitted from the Academy Award for Digital Painting.

Ed, this is a lie, and you know it. Just because Steve and I don't particularly like each other is no excuse for dissembling the truth. It is very embarrassing to me to tell friends my history then have them say that none of it is mentioned at Pixar's website, and for magazine articles to completely disregard my role. It can only be a systematic misrepresentation.

I am very clear about what happened, and I'm sure you are too. We started the company together. I was the first to suggest it even. We bought how-to-start-business books together on the first day at Larkspur Landing. We attended all the founding meetings together for months. We met with Steve at his home together. We interviewed all the prospective employees together at that Thai restaurant. We signed the founding documents together. We both received individual copies of the 3-volume bound leather papers of the deal with our names in gold on them. I am not just another of the 44 or so legal "co-founders." We Co-Founded Pixar together. Pure and simple, and I want it acknowledged. It just looks small of you not to do so. You are clearly the leader at Pixar and always were number one, and I have never denied you that. You don't need to deny me. You have the last 13 years of sole leadership and all of the future. It is very important to me to be acknowledged as the [not "a"] co-founder of Pixar. This is a fair description of my role.

The recent *Wired* magazine makes no mention of me and even gives you credit for the "Genesis Demo," which was my concept and direction, again as you well know. This too appears to be a willful bending of the facts and further evidence of a chronic problem of denial that a little leadership could readily fix.

This is painful to me and I hope embarrassing to you. Please do something about it. This kind of letter should be unnecessary. Just tell the story as it is.

I am reminded of at least one earlier time in our history together when I finally realized that, despite your inherent goodness, you were not going to speak up for me in meetings with outsiders, and finally said so. After that, you were careful to include me, and to say "we" instead of "I". Perhaps this is again the problem. I hope it will have the same conclusion.

Sincerely

Alvy Ray Smith PhD
3420 Cascadia Av S
Seattle WA 98144
206.721.1432
alvyray@alvyray.com email
<http://alvyray.com> website